

Extra Care
Site options appraisal

Appendix 1

Property		Benbow III	Douglas Bader	Elizabeth House	Martin House	Nuffield House	Queensmead II	Southfields / Newry	Tilling Road		
1	Shape and size of site	Comments	8637 m ² of regular shape remaining for Phase 3 development.	4359 m ² of regular shape.	3864 m ² of regular shape. Site has considerable slope from East to West.	6147 m ² without the cottage. Irregular shape.	4234 m ² of regular shape.	Approx 11337 m ² left after Phase 1 development. Somewhat irregular shape but large enough to provide suitably shaped site for Extra Care.	Southfields 6525m ² . Newry 5772m ² . Both regular shape.	12568 m ² . Somewhat irregular shape but large enough to provide suitably shaped site for Extra Care.	
		Initial score	5	5	3	3	4	5	5	5	
		Weighting	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
		Weighted score	25	25	15	15	20	25	25	25	
2	Location	Comments									
		Initial score	5	3	5	5	5	5	5	5	
		Weighting	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	
		Weighted score	10	6	10	10	10	10	10	10	
3	Ease of access	Comments									
		Initial score	3	4	3	5	3	4	5	4	
		Weighting	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	
		Weighted score	15	20	15	25	15	20	25	20	
4	Distance to nearest GP	Comments									
		Initial score	2	5	2	2	3	3	3	5	
		Weighting	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	
		Weighted score	6	15	6	6	9	9	9	15	
5	Distance to nearest pharmacy	Comments									
		Initial score	2	1	2	3	4	1	5	5	
		Weighting	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	
		Weighted score	4	2	4	6	8	2	10	10	
6	Access to adult social care support facilities	Comments									
		Initial score	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	5	
		Weighting	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	
		Weighted score	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	
7	Access to leisure facilities	Comments									
		Initial score	3	5	5	0	3	3	4	3	
		Weighting	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	
		Weighted score	12	20	20	0	12	12	16	12	
8	Site environment	Comments	Residential area. Limited local services.	Located in a mixed area with residential blocks / housing adjacent and commercial / industrial in the locality. Close to Malabar Rd facilities.	Residential area reasonably close to the Aikman Avenue shopping area and leisure / community facilities	Residential area close to existing facilities for older people and the Allandale Rd / Francis St shopping area. Very quiet with pleasant grounds.	Residential area reasonably close to Narborough Road shopping facilities. Quiet area with pleasant grounds including mature woodland.	Residential area. Limited local services.	Residential area, close to local shops and facilities.	Residential area in close proximity to services at Home Farm Square. Adjacent land likely to be future ASC Intermediate Care / short term residential care development.	
		Initial score	2	1	3	4	4	4	2	4	
		Weighting	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	
		Weighted score	10	5	15	20	20	20	10	20	
9	Availability / other interest	Comments	The first phase of Benbow was provided by an RSL putting in infrastructure and affordable housing. Potential for remainder to be sold for private housing but no market interest. Recently funding approved for RSL to build a second phase comprising 17 units. Remainder of site available.	Existing Day Centre due to close Autumn 2014 and Health and Safety Training Section actively looking for alternative location	EPH closed April 2014. Due to be sold at auction in September 2014.	Existing Day Centre closed Dec 13 but occupiers of first floor office accommodation would need to be relocated. Property being marketed for sale.	EPH closed June 2014. Likely to be sold at auction later in the year.	Former school site, now cleared and recently an RSL has been funded to provide a first phase of development on the site of 20 houses. Required to be completed by March 2015. Remainder of site available for development, assumption would be sale for housing (affordable or market).	The Southfield site is currently vacant and has been through school closure process. It is currently not being looked at for future school provision. The Newry is occupied by S BSS (Secondary Behavioural Support Service) and use may require their relocation. Formal school closure would also be needed.	Site identified for future residential development. This scheme may act as a catalyst for such development by providing the 20% affordable housing element.	
		Initial score	4	3	4	3	4	4	2	4	
		Weighting	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	
		Weighted score	12	9	12	9	12	12	6	12	
10	Restrictions on development	Comments	Site has had outline consent for residential development, 47 units in phases II and III in total. Underground holding tank on frontage to be incorporated as part of green space.	None known although parking is known to be a particular issue in that area.	None known.	Site in conservation area with known TPO's. Tenant with secure tenancy in the Cottage.	Known TPO's on site.	The development would need to link into first phase above and pay a share of infrastructure costs.	Existing user in the Newry.	None known. Possible need for highway upgrade.	
		Initial score	4	3	5	2	4	4	4	4	
		Weighting	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	
		Weighted score	12	5	15	6	12	12	12	12	

Extra Care
Site options appraisal

Appendix 1

Property		Benbow III	Douglas Bader	Elizabeth House	Martin House	Nuffield House	Queensmead II	Southfields / Newry	Tilling Road
11 Site Valuation	Comments	Restricted Information	Restricted Information	Restricted Information	Restricted Information	Restricted Information	Restricted Information	Restricted Information	Restricted Information
	Initial score	5	4	3	1	2	4	4	4
	Weighting	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
	Weighted score	10	8	6	2	4	8	8	8
12 Deliverability risks	Comments	Main risk is whether there will be sufficient land left in phase III, and if so whether it will be the right shape for the development as second phase design and layout not yet in place.	Requires closure and demolition of existing day centre and former four storey care home currently on site.	Requires demolition of existing EPH facility.	Requires closure and demolition of existing Day Centre and office accommodation. May also require negotiations with secure tenant if Cottage is to be included.	Requires demolition of current EPH facility	Need to link with phase I development for which design and layout not yet determined.	Part occupied site. Demolition required.	Site is currently classed as open space but again not thought to be a significant issue in this case.
		3	3	4	3	4	3	2	4
		4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
	12	12	16	12	16	12	8	16	
Total		128	127	134	103	138	142	139	160

Tilling Road	160	0
Queensmead II	142	18
Southfields / Newry	139	21
Nuffield House	138	22
Elizabeth House	134	26
Benbow III	128	32
Douglas Bader	127	33
Martin House	103	57

Critical Criteria	
Sites included in original appraisal but later ruled out as they failed to meet critical criteria:	
Herrick Lodge	Failed criteria for Ease of Access Minimum standard of 3 - scored 2
John Ellis	Failed criteria for Ease of Access Minimum standard of 3 - scored 2
Conduit Street	Failed criteria for Site Size Minimum standard of 3,864 sq. m - Only 2,112 sq. m including private ownership)
Ashton Green 1	Due to uncertainty over the nature and timings of the development, it proved impossible to score any criteria with any reliability

